



Implementation of Propemperda Policy in the Bukittinggi City DPRD Environment

Aurelia Valentin Edward¹, Aldri Frinaldi^{2*}

^{1,2}Master of Public Administration, Universitas Negeri Padang, Indonesia

Coessponding: aldri@fis.unp.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:

Implementation; Policy; Propemperda; Realized; Environment.

ABSTRACT

Propemperda as a planning document that can be used to measure the achievement of the performance of the establishment of Local Regulations. Propemperda is implemented by the DPRD and Local Government based on the regional policy. Propemperda Bukittinggi city 2019 realized 8 out of 22 draft regional regulations. At least Propemperda Bukittinggi city realized, it is necessary to look at the implementation of Propemperda policy in the DPRD bukittinggi city. The theory of implementation according to Van Meter and Van Horn there are 6 (six) variables that affect: Standards and Purposed of Policy, Resources, Characteristics of Implementing Organizations, Interorganization Communication, Disposition, and Social, Economic, and Political Factors. This research uses a descriptive qualitative research method with the inductive approach. The data collection techniques are obtained from observations, interviews, and documentation. The collected data is analyzed with data reduction techniques, data display, and concluding. The results of the data analysis that Propemperda is not realized because proposals outside Propemperda are more important. In addition, human resources are also limited due to different educational backgrounds, as well as a lack of experts. The DPRD Bukittinggi city also lacks socialization of Propemperda to related parties. Finally, it was suggested to the DPRD Bukittinggi to be equipped comprehensively about Propemperda through technical guidance, and more actively conduct Propemperda socialization.

1. Introduction

The Programme for the Formation of Regional Regulations (Propemperda) serves as a strategic planning document to assess the success of the Regional People's Representative Council and the Regional Government in creating regional regulations (Hunawa et al., n.d.; Pamungkas & Yusuf, 2019). The Program for the Formation of Regional Regulations is organized in a deliberate, cohesive, and methodical manner, encompassing strategies for creating draft regional regulations that are considered significant and prioritized to ensure legal clarity for regional programs and activities (Lacoere &

Leinfelder, 2023; Maes, 2008; Roberts, 2006). The Regional People's Representative Council and the Regional Government jointly execute the Regional Regulation Formation Program. The Regional Regulation Formation Program is established over a period of one year, employing a priority scale that is decided by specific criteria.

The Regional Regulation Formation Program within the Regional People's Representative Council of Bukittinggi City, West Sumatra Province, was developed through a series of steps, including inventory, selection, coordination, determination, and distribution. The Regional Regulation Formation Agency,

which is part of the regional People's Representative Council apparatus, is responsible for coordinating the production of the Program for the Formation of Regional Regulations within the Regional People's Representative Council. The Regional Regulation Formation Program encompasses suggestions put forth by members, factions, commissions, or a mix thereof.

Only eight draft regional regulations were successfully issued in the 2019 Bukittinggi City Regional Regulation Formation Program. The failure to fully implement the Regional Regulation Formation Program can be attributed to a lack of preparedness and strategic planning. In addition, another issue that may arise during the finalization of the Draft Regional Regulations is the potential delay in timeliness due to various factors, such as the sudden emergence of community dynamics that necessitate an immediate response from the Bukittinggi City Regional People's Representative Council.

The proficiency of regulatory players in formulating regional regulations can significantly impact the process of creating regional regulation formation programs, owing to their educational background, attributes, and political competence (Auld et al., 2015; Jetschke & Murray, 2020; Ponte & Daugbjerg, 2015). The Bukittinggi City Regional People's Representative Council should possess a thorough understanding of this issue, enabling them to carry out the process of creating regional regulations in a proficient and competent manner. In addition to anticipating societal advancements, one can also contemplate future scenarios in order to ensure the following laws or regulations are of superior caliber. The government's efficacy is not measured by the sheer number of draft regional regulations but rather by its ability to formulate and accomplish a policy.

The author aims to analyze the implementation of the Regional Regulation Formation Program in the Bukittinggi City Regional People's Representative Council. This analysis will focus on the procedures involved in preparing the program, particularly within the council, and evaluating the accomplishments of the planning document.

2. Literature Review

There exists a policy or regulation, and there is an individual responsible for enforcing it. Each individual or organization may have varying perspectives and approaches when it comes to implementing a rule or policy, depending on its intended purpose (Castillo & Cazarini, 2014; Jongman, 2017; Koksalmis & Kabak, 2019). Different rules or regulations might not elicit the same response, so several factors will affect the implementation (Antal et al., 2017; Chan et al., 2019; Grindle, 2017). According to Mazmanian & Sabatier (1980), political implementation refers to the enforcement of decisions, typically through the enactment of laws. However, it can also involve significant executive directives, judgments, or even judicial rulings. Typically, the decision outlines the issues that need to be resolved, clearly defines the goals that need to be accomplished, and provides guidelines for managing the implementation process (Belton & Stewart, 2002; Hervani et al., 2005; Poister et al., 2014).

According to Van Metter & Van Horn in Putera & Valentina (2011), "policy implementation performance" refers to the assessment of how well specific standards and targets set in a policy have been met. Evaluating the implementation of a policy involves analyzing its performance and outcomes and determining whether it has been successful or unsuccessful. The success of a policy implementation can be assessed by examining the variables that influence it. Van Metter & Van Horn identify six policy implementation variables: size and purpose of the policy, resources, characteristics of the executive body or agency, inter-organization communications and implementation activities, economic, social, and political conditions, and attitudes toward the implementation policy Programme (Gerhart et al., 2009; Mardhatillah, 2021; May et al., 2013; Purtle et al., 2023). Local legislation the author conducts an analysis using Van Meter and Van Horn Theory, which utilizes six criteria to evaluate the success of policy implementation. The author will investigate six variables based on the results collected during the government applied research internship.

3. Methods

Descriptive qualitative research is a method used to describe, understand, and analyze the implementation of the Regional Regulatory Programme in the Environment of the Council of People's Representatives of the Municipality of Bukittinggi Province of Western Sumatra. This research is based on real phenomena and the current situation during the government's applied research internship (Miles et al., 2018). To get the data in the field, the author conducted observations, interviews, and documentation. The observations were conducted by closely examining the conditions and events that took place in the field, specifically in relation to the implementation of the policy outlined in the Regional Regulation Program within the jurisdiction of the Council of People's Representatives in the Municipality of Bukittinggi. The findings of the observation are documented in a record for further investigation. Subsequent interviews were carried out with multiple informants, specifically the DPRD leader, the Commission Chairman, the Bapemperda chairman, and other council members, including officers from the Secretariat of the Council of People's Representatives of the District of Bukittinggi City. The documentation served as corroborative evidence during government-sponsored research internships.

The data collected during the government applied research internship was evaluated using the Miles & Huberman model, specifically employing techniques such as data reduction, data display, and conclusion drafting. Data reduction involves the collection of data from informants, followed by the systematic organization and categorization of the data based on its intended use. Data will be gathered based on acquired information and subsequently structured to facilitate the derivation of conclusions. The conclusion is derived from the most recent data analysis (Hesse-Biber, 2010).

4. Result

The effectiveness of implementation can be assessed by the scope and goals of a policy that align with the socio-cultural context of its enforcement (Bahinipati & Panigrahi, 2018; Villanueva & Blokland, 2016). The greater the level of idealism in a policy, the more challenging

it becomes to implement. Van Meter and Van Horn contended that policy implementation performance may be assessed by establishing specific standards and targets that policy implementers should meet (Mardhatillah, 2021). Policy performance essentially involves evaluating the extent to which these standards or targets are being met.

The policy on the Regional Regulatory Programme for the Regional People's Representative Council aims to provide technical guidance for the development of comprehensive and coordinated regional regulatory planning instruments. The objective of this policy is to offer direction on the procedures for developing and overseeing the optimal regional regulatory program and to establish a shared understanding among the stakeholders of the legislative regulations and the entities involved in the preparation and management of the regional regulatory Program (Kirlin et al., 2013; Tunnicliffe et al., 2020). Council members, as enforcers of the Regional Regulatory Program policy, comprehend the guidelines for preparing the Regional Regularization Program (Ostrom, 2019; Rosan, 2016). These guidelines are outlined in Regulations of the People's Representative Council of the District of Bukittinggi City No. 2 of 2017, which specify the procedure for preparing the Regional Regulation Program within the Council of People's Representatives of the Region. The policy adheres to the aforementioned rules. Nevertheless, the implementation of the Regional Regulatory Program is currently facing delays due to the prioritization of other regional regulatory programs. These include policy modifications mandated by the central government, which the regional government is obligated to adhere to.

The presence of human resources is crucial for the effective execution of a policy or program. The implementation process requires a greater level of qualified human resources while also taking into account financial and time resources when determining the effectiveness of the policy (Armstrong, 2006; Guest, 2011). Human beings play a crucial role in determining the actions performed during policy implementation (Rao, 2009). This includes the execution of policy, as human beings select how to allocate financial resources and time based on their thinking. The

efficacy of the enforcement will dictate the achievement of the standards and policy objectives (Al-Waqfi & Forstenlechner, 2014; Gunningham & Sinclair, 2019). Human attributes can be logically inferred from one's educational background, professional experience, and personal characteristics (Hallowell, 2017). As a policy enforcer, it also necessitates resources that can facilitate the implementation of the policy.

Van Meter and Van Horn contend that knowledge, comprehension, and policy depth are the three determinants of policy implementation. Van Meter and Van Horn assert that the policy maker, who is a member of the People's Council of the District of Bukittinggi City, will interpret this policy differently based on their distinct educational backgrounds.

In addition, the primary role of the People's Council of Representatives of the District of Bukittinggi is not only to create the Regional Rules but also to hinder the execution of the Regional Regulations Development Programme. The members of the Council still have to carry out budgetary and supervisory tasks. In order to ensure the prioritization of the proposed Regional Regulatory Programme (Raperda) in the Council of Regional People's Representatives, it is imperative to provide academic publications that have thoroughly examined the technical aspects of the drafting process. Nevertheless, the presence of proficient individuals specializing in the creation of scholarly manuscripts has not materialized, resulting in a postponement of the execution of the Regional Regulatory Program. This delay is attributed to the extensive duration required for the comprehensive examination of the academic script that is to be discussed.

Van Meter and Van Horn argue that when implementing a policy or program, executives must possess strong organizational traits that prioritize adherence to rules and conformity to legal punishments. Within the vicinity of the People's Representative Council of the District of Bukittinggi, there exists a well-organized system outlined in the Regulations of the People's Representative Council of the District of Bukittinggi No. 1 of 2020. These regulations serve as guidelines for implementing the policy of the Regional Regulatory Program.

The Bapemperda, which is responsible for making regional regulations, has collected proposals from the Council of People's Representatives of the District of Bukittinggi. These proposals will be compiled into a Regional Regulation Making Program in the DPRD. Yesterday, in 2020, the Regional Regulatory Body of the City of Bukittinggi successfully compiled a total of 10 Raperda (Regional Regulations) to be submitted for inclusion in the Urban Regulatory Plan. However, none of these 10 rappers were effectively incorporated into the municipal regulatory program following discussions with the regional Government. The Regional People's Representative Council currently enforces several regulations within the local regulatory Scheme. Specifically, there are 3 out of the 14 regulations that have been successfully implemented in the Urban Regulatory Plan. Unfortunately, three of these regulations do not align with the Environmental Regulation Scheme agreed upon in the internal council meeting of the Council of Municipal Representatives. This indicates that the preparedness of the DPRD is not optimal due to the inadequacy of the proposed proposals and the lack of readiness of the academic manuscripts. These manuscripts will be evaluated during the coordination meeting with the regional government, where the rappers should be given priority while others may not receive the same level of priority. Furthermore, the regional budget will serve as a crucial factor in Raperda's inclusion in the Regional Regulatory Program.

Effective communication is essential for conveying information and ensuring that the goals and objectives of this policy are clearly stated (Quirke, 2017; J. Wu et al., 2018). Providing comprehensive information to implementers and other stakeholders, including the public, will facilitate the successful implementation of the policy. In addition, council members also lack the dissemination of the regional regulatory program to the public and relevant stakeholders (Gao & Yu, 2020; Sayce et al., 2013). The objective of the socialization of the regional regulatory program is to standardize the regulations among the concerned parties in order to efficiently and accurately implement the regional regulatory program, hence expediting the realization of the Raperda.

The implementers have comprehended the policy of the Regional Regulatory Programme in the vicinity of the People's Representative Council of the Municipality of Bukittinggi. However, they are facing significant challenges in its technical execution due to the fact that the tasks and functions of the Council of Representatives of the Local People extend beyond the mere establishment of the Programme of Regional Regulation. The Regional Regulatory Body will present the compiled Regional Regulation Programme at a coordination meeting with the Regional Law Division or the relevant city government in order to construct the District Regulatory Programme for the City of Bukittinggi. Following the 2021 Agreement on the Development of the Regional Regulations of Bukittinggi, a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) was formed between the People's Representative Council of the District of Bukittinggi and the Mayor of the Higher City.

The implementation of the Agreement on the Regional Regulatory Programme should aim to achieve the whole prioritized Raperda for the upcoming year. The Regional People's Representative Council has established a division of work, which includes the preparation of the Regional Regulations Development Programme (Coe et al., 2017; Hall & Tewdwr-Jones, 2019). This task is carried out by the regional regulatory body and the commission, or group, responsible for implementing the programmes. The City of Bukittinggi's Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD) will collaborate with relevant stakeholders and establish a dedicated committee to expedite the deliberation of the proposed regional regulation (Raperda) and be prepared for negotiations.

It is desirable that the Regional Regulatory Program, once formed, be distributed to the entire community according to its regulations (Haufler, 2013; H. Wu et al., 2020). The socialization of the development of regional regulations in the City of Bukittinggi to the entire community will positively influence the subsequent discussion of the regional regulation Plans. Failure to disseminate the regional regulations may result in public rejection when they are discussed by the district Government. If these regulations are rejected after becoming official, it will be disadvantageous for the

regional government in terms of both time and cost. The public has the option to submit their proposals to the Regional Regulatory Programme through the Council or the related Regional Government Working Scheme. However, without the public being informed about the regional regulatory program, they will not have knowledge about the specific mechanisms involved in its formulation.

The purpose of disseminating the District Regulations of the City of Bukittinggi to the public is to gauge the people's response and critique regarding the proposed establishment of the Regional Regulations in order to determine their level of acceptance. Individuals that possess a higher level of knowledge regarding the circumstances at hand possess a greater understanding of the societal, financial, and governmental circumstances in the specific area. Once the Regional Regulatory Program is socialized, the public has the opportunity to actively modify the draft Regional Regulations depending on the evolving social, economic, and political realities in society. The public's evaluation of such issues may be suitable or unsuitable and thereafter submitted directly to the regional government for additional measures.

Both internal and external issues are impeding the implementation of the Regional Regulatory Programme in the vicinity of the People's Representative Council of the Municipality of Bukittinggi. The implementation of the regional regulatory program is hindered by internal factors, specifically policy changes initiated by the central Government. These changes grant the Regional Government and the Municipal People's Representatives Council the authority to take action before the program can be executed, resulting in delays. Moreover, the limited human resources pose a challenge in executing the Regional Regulatory Program due to the varying competencies of each council member. Unforeseen shifts in the community's characteristics can impact the regional government's policy.

The People's Representative Council of the District of Bukittinggi, in collaboration with the Secretariat of the Council of People's Representatives of the Districts of Bukittinggi, is

taking measures to address the challenges in implementing the Regional Regulatory Programme near the Municipal People's Representative Council. These measures include enhancing human resources through technical guidance, training, and approval, as well as promoting awareness of the regional regulatory programs and engaging the community and relevant regional organizations.

5. Conclusion

The implementation of the Regional Regulatory Programme in the vicinity of the People's Representative Council of the Municipality of Bukittinggi has encountered difficulties, preventing the complete execution of the program. The Council of People's Representatives in the District of Bukittinggi City continues to consider ideas that are not included in the Regional Regulatory Programme. The number of employees, tasks, and educational background are all factors that affect the council's human resources. Regarding inter-agency communications, there is a lack of socialization or transmission of information from the Regional Regulatory Program to the public. Social, economic, and political factors in the community have an impact on the execution of the Regional Regulations Plans, which are a component of the Regional Regulations Programme.

Additionally, there are some recommendations that can be utilized as potential assessment resources in the future. The People's Council of the District of Bukittinggi City should acquire a more extensive comprehension of the Regional Regulatory Programme. This can be achieved through technical assistance, training, or self-study in order to strengthen their capacity. Furthermore, the execution of a rule that establishes specific standards or quantifiable objectives for the Regional People's Representative Council in carrying out the Regional Regulatory Programme, which will facilitate the management of regional government operations. Furthermore, when establishing a regional regulatory program within the regional people's representative council, it is crucial to consider the readiness of the academic draft or document and its content, as well as the social, economic, and political variables within the community.

References

- Al-Waqfi, M. A., & Forstenlechner, I. (2014). Barriers to Emiratization: The role of policy design and institutional environment in determining the effectiveness of Emiratization. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 25(2), 167–189.
- Antal, A., Alekseichuk, I., Bikson, M., Brockmüller, J., Brunoni, A. R., Chen, R., Cohen, L. G., Dowthwaite, G., Ellrich, J., & Flöel, A. (2017). Low intensity transcranial electric stimulation: safety, ethical, legal regulatory and application guidelines. *Clinical Neurophysiology*, 128(9), 1774–1809.
- Armstrong, M. (2006). *A handbook of human resource management practice*. Kogan Page Publishers.
- Auld, G., Renckens, S., & Cashore, B. (2015). Transnational private governance between the logics of empowerment and control. *Regulation & Governance*, 9(2), 108–124.
- Bahinipati, B. K., & Panigrahi, S. S. (2018). A framework for sustainable supply chains: Evaluation of implementation barriers. *International Journal of Intelligent Enterprise*, 5(3), 231–265.
- Belton, V., & Stewart, T. (2002). *Multiple criteria decision analysis: an integrated approach*. Springer Science & Business Media.
- Castillo, L. A. M., & Cazarini, E. W. (2014). Integrated model for implementation and development of knowledge management. *Knowledge Management Research & Practice*, 12, 145–160.
- Chan, D. W. M., Olawumi, T. O., & Ho, A. M. L. (2019). Perceived benefits of and barriers to Building Information Modelling (BIM) implementation in construction: The case of Hong Kong. *Journal of Building Engineering*, 25, 100764.
- Coe, N. M., Hess, M., Yeung, H. W., Dicken, P., & Henderson, J. (2017). 'Globalizing' regional development: a global production networks perspective. In *Economy* (pp. 199–215). Routledge.
- Gao, X., & Yu, J. (2020). Public governance mechanism in the prevention and control of

- the COVID-19: information, decision-making and execution. *Journal of Chinese Governance*.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/23812346.2020.1744922>
- Gerhart, B., Rynes, S. L., & Fulmer, I. S. (2009). 6 pay and performance: individuals, groups, and executives. *The Academy of Management Annals*, 3(1), 251–315.
- Grindle, M. S. (2017). *Politics and policy implementation in the Third World* (Vol. 4880). Princeton University Press.
- Guest, D. E. (2011). Human resource management and performance: still searching for some answers. *Human Resource Management Journal*, 21(1), 3–13.
- Gunningham, N., & Sinclair, D. (2019). Regulatory pluralism: Designing policy mixes for environmental protection. In *Environmental Law* (pp. 463–490). Routledge.
- Hall, P., & Tewdwr-Jones, M. (2019). *Urban and regional planning*. Routledge.
- Hallowell, A. I. (2017). *Culture and experience*. University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Haufler, V. (2013). *A public role for the private sector: Industry self-regulation in a global economy*. Carnegie Endowment.
- Hervani, A. A., Helms, M. M., & Sarkis, J. (2005). Performance measurement for green supply chain management. *Benchmarking: An International Journal*, 12(4), 330–353.
- Hesse-Biber, S. (2010). Qualitative approaches to mixed methods practice. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 16(6), 455–468.
- Hunawa, R., Aneta, A., Husain, W., & Wantu, F. M. (n.d.). *The Turbulence of the Characteristics of Organization towards the Effectiveness of Local Regulation Establishment in Bone Bolango*.
- Jetschke, A., & Murray, P. (2020). Diffusing regional integration: the EU and Southeast Asia. In *From Europeanisation to Diffusion* (pp. 174–191). Routledge.
- Jongman, A. J. (2017). *Political terrorism: A new guide to actors, authors, concepts, data bases, theories, and literature*. Routledge.
- Kirlin, J., Caldwell, M., Gleason, M., Weber, M., Ugoretz, J., Fox, E., & Miller-Henson, M. (2013). California's Marine Life Protection Act Initiative: supporting implementation of legislation establishing a statewide network of marine protected areas. *Ocean & Coastal Management*, 74, 3–13.
- Koksalmis, E., & Kabak, Ö. (2019). Deriving decision makers' weights in group decision making: An overview of objective methods. *Information Fusion*, 49, 146–160.
- Lacoere, P., & Leinfelder, H. (2023). Land oversupply. How rigid land-use planning and legal certainty hinder new policy for Flanders. *European Planning Studies*, 31(9), 1926–1948.
- Maes, F. (2008). The international legal framework for marine spatial planning. *Marine Policy*, 32(5), 797–810.
- Mardhatillah, M. (2021). Implementasi Program Usaha Peningkatan Pendapatan Keluarga Sejahtera (UPPKS) Untuk Pemberdayaan Masyarakat Miskin di Kota Padang Panjang. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ekotrans & Erudisi*, 1(1), 76–87.
- May, T., Harris, S., & Collins, M. (2013). Implementing community sport policy: Understanding the variety of voluntary club types and their attitudes to policy. *International Journal of Sport Policy and Politics*, 5(3), 397–419.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2018). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook*. Sage publications.
- Ostrom, E. (2019). Institutional rational choice: An assessment of the institutional analysis and development framework. In *Theories of the policy process, second edition* (pp. 21–64). Routledge.
- Pamungkas, B., & Yusuf, M. (2019). Exploring Digital Legislation Concepts and Practices: Inspiration for Indonesia City Government. *International Conference on Democratisation in Southeast Asia (ICDeSA 2019)*, 322–328.
- Poister, T. H., Aristigueta, M. P., & Hall, J. L. (2014). *Managing and measuring performance in public and nonprofit organizations: An integrated approach*. John Wiley & Sons.

- Ponte, S., & Daugbjerg, C. (2015). Biofuel sustainability and the formation of transnational hybrid governance. *Environmental Politics*, 24(1), 96–114.
- Purtle, J., Stadnick, N. A., Wynecoop, M., Bruns, E. J., Crane, M. E., & Aarons, G. (2023). A policy implementation study of earmarked taxes for mental health services: study protocol. *Implementation Science Communications*, 4(1), 37.
- Putera, R. E., & Valentina, T. R. (2011). Implementasi Program KTP Elektronik (e-KTP) di Daerah Percontohan. *Mimbar: Jurnal Sosial Dan Pembangunan*, 27(2), 193–201.
- Quirke, B. (2017). *Making the connections: Using internal communication to turn strategy into action*. Routledge.
- Rao, P. S. (2009). *Personnel and human resource management*. Himalaya Publishing House Girgaon.
- Roberts, P. (2006). Evaluating regional sustainable development: Approaches, methods and the politics of analysis. *Journal of Environmental Planning and Management*, 49(4), 515–532.
- Rosan, C. D. (2016). *Governing the fragmented metropolis: Planning for regional sustainability*. University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Sabatier, P., & Mazmanian, D. (1980). The implementation of public policy: A framework of analysis. *Policy Studies Journal*, 8(4), 538–560.
- Sayce, K., Shuman, C., Connor, D., Reisewitz, A., Pope, E., Miller-Henson, M., Poncelet, E., Monié, D., & Owens, B. (2013). Beyond traditional stakeholder engagement: public participation roles in California's statewide marine protected area planning process. *Ocean & Coastal Management*, 74, 57–66.
- Tunncliffe, V., Metaxas, A., Le, J., Ramirez-Llodra, E., & Levin, L. A. (2020). Strategic environmental goals and objectives: setting the basis for environmental regulation of deep seabed mining. *Marine Policy*, 114, 103347.
- Villanueva, C. E. D., & Blokland, M. W. (2016). Voluntary water utility benchmarking for collective learning: Lessons from Europe. *International Journal of Water*, 10(2–3), 139–154.
- Wu, H., Hao, Y., & Ren, S. (2020). How do environmental regulation and environmental decentralization affect green total factor energy efficiency: Evidence from China. *Energy Economics*, 91, 104880.
- Wu, J., Guo, S., Huang, H., Liu, W., & Xiang, Y. (2018). Information and communications technologies for sustainable development goals: state-of-the-art, needs and perspectives. *IEEE Communications Surveys & Tutorials*, 20(3), 2389–2406.